1+1+2 Covariant Approach to Gravitational Lensing in *f(R)* gravity

Anne Marie Nzioki

University of Cape Town

Workshop on String Theory & Cosmology, Wits, 01/1220/09



Early Motivation:

- To question Einstein's GR [Weyl 1918, Eddington1923]
- Account for GR's limitations at high energy regimes [Starobisnky 1980]
- Contemporary Motivation:

Observational evidence:

- CMB
- Snla
- Weak Lensing

Observational evidence:

Flat, accelerating universe driven by a negative pressure component – *dark energy*



Einstein's GR

- Cosmological Constant Λ model (Dark Energy) + CDM = Λ CDM Universe (flat & homogenous)
- Quintessence
- Incomplete! Coincidence problem + Discrepancy in Λ value

Modified Gravity

- Geometric origin for dark energy
- Proposals: brane world theories, higher order curvature invariants
 → fourth order gravity

f(R) class of models:

- Fourth order theory of gravity
- Must account for observational tests like bending of light corresponding to:
 - Null geodesics
 - Knowledge of physically viable spherically symmetric solutions as in GR

• f(R) class of models can be derived from the classical action:

$$A = \frac{1}{2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \left[f(R) + 2\mathcal{L}_m \right]$$

• f(R) class of models can be derived from the classical action:

$$A = \frac{1}{2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \left[f(R) + 2\mathcal{L}_m \right]$$

General function of curvature R

• f(R) class of models can be derived from the classical action:

$$A = \frac{1}{2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} \left[f(R) + 2\mathcal{L}_m \right]$$

Standard matter term

• f(R) class of models can be derived from the classical action: $A = \frac{1}{2} \int d^4 x \sqrt{-g} [f(R) + 2\mathcal{L}_m]$

Varying the action with respect to the metric gives the following field equations:

$$f'G_{ab} = f'\left(R_{ab} - \frac{1}{2}g_{ab}R\right) = T_{ab}^{m} + \frac{1}{2}g_{ab}(f - Rf') + \nabla_{b}\nabla_{a}f' - g_{ab}\nabla_{c}\nabla^{c}f'$$

where

$$G_{ab} = \tilde{T}_{ab}^m + T_{ab}^R = T_{ab}^{tot}, \qquad f = f(R), \qquad f' = \frac{df(R)}{dR}$$

- f(R) class of models can be derived from the classical action: $A = \frac{1}{2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} [f(R) + 2\mathcal{L}_m]$
- Varying the action with respect to the metric gives the following field equations:

$$f'G_{ab} = f'\left(R_{ab} - \frac{1}{2}g_{ab}R\right) = T_{ab}^{m} + \frac{1}{2}g_{ab}(f - Rf') + \nabla_{b}\nabla_{a}f' - g_{ab}\nabla_{c}\nabla^{c}f'$$

where

$$G_{ab} = \tilde{T}^m_{ab} + T^R_{ab} = T^{tot}_{ab},$$

4th order gravity as standard GR in the presence of two effective fluids.

1+3 Covariant Approach

- Space-time as an ideal fluid with a 1+3 threading of the manifold
 - w.r.t time-like congruence e.g., the fluid flow of galaxy cluster in cosmology or any fluid flow in astrophysics or cosmology.
 - and remaining 3-D spatial freedom. [Ehlers 1961, Ellis 1971]
- Gives general set of equations based on Ricci and Bianchi identities.
- Physical covariant variables with easy interpretation for co-moving observers.

1+3 Covariant Approach

- From the time-like flow u^a we construct the projection onto 3-D surfaces orthogonal to the flow: $h_{ab} = g_{ab} + u_a u_b$; $u^a u_a = -1$
- Covariant convective derivative : $\dot{T}_{c...d}^{a...b} = u^e \nabla_e T_{c...d}^{a...b}$
- Spatial covariant derivative:

 $D_e T_{c...d}^{a...b} = h_e^f h_g^a ... h_h^b h_c^i ... h_d^j \nabla_f T_{i...j}^{g...h}$ • Kinematics of u^a gives information about the space -time geometry. $\nabla u_i = -u_i \dot{u}_i + \frac{1}{-\Theta}h_i + \sigma_i + \omega_i$

$$\nabla_{a}u_{b} = -u_{a}\dot{u}_{b} + \frac{1}{3}\Theta h_{ab} + \sigma_{ab} + \omega_{ab}$$
acceleration expansion shear vorticity

1+3 Covariant Approach



Effective Thermodynamics

The total energy-momentum tensor (EMT) is:

$$T_{ab}^{tot} = T_{ab}^m + T_{ab}^R$$

where

- *T^m* is the matter EMT
- *T^R* is the curvature EMT

$$T_{ab}^{R} = \frac{1}{2}g_{ab}(f - Rf') + \nabla_{b}\nabla_{a}f' - g_{ab}\nabla_{c}\nabla^{c}f'$$

Effective Thermodynamics

The total EMT can be decomposed as usual relative to u^a giving:

$$\begin{split} \mu^{tot} &= T_{ab}^{tot} u^a u^b = \tilde{\mu}^m + \mu^R, \\ q_a^{tot} &= -T_{bc}^{tot} h_a^b u^c = \tilde{q}_a^m + q_a^R, \end{split} \begin{array}{l} p^{tot} &= \frac{1}{3} T_{ab}^{tot} h^{ab} = \tilde{p}^m + p^R, \\ \pi_{ab}^{tot} &= -T_{cd}^{tot} h_{}^d = \tilde{\pi}_{ab}^m + \pi_{ab}^R. \end{split}$$

Effective Thermodynamics

where the total thermodynamic quantities are:

$$\begin{split} \mu^{tot} &= \frac{1}{f'} \Big[\mu^m + \frac{1}{2} (Rf' - f) + f'' D^a R D_a R + f'' D^2 R - \Theta f'' \dot{R} \Big], \\ p^{tot} &= \frac{1}{f'} \Big[p^m + \frac{1}{2} (f - Rf') - \frac{2}{3} f'' D^2 R - \frac{2}{3} f'' D^a R D_a R \\ &\quad + \frac{2}{3} \Theta f'' \dot{R} + f''' \dot{R}^2 + f''' \ddot{R} - \dot{u}_c (\nabla^c f') \Big], \\ \pi^{tot}_{ab} &= \frac{1}{f'} \Big[\pi^m_{ab} + f'' D_{} R + f'' D_{} R - \sigma_{ab} \dot{f}' \Big], \\ q^{tot}_{ab} &= -\frac{1}{f'} \Big[q^m_{ab} + f'' \dot{R} D_a R + f'' D_a \dot{R} - \frac{1}{3} \Theta f'' D_a R \Big]. \end{split}$$

Null geodesics

- Light propagates as null geodesics
- Null tangent vector k^a

$$k^{a}k_{a} = 0, \quad \frac{\delta k^{a}}{\delta v} = k^{b}\nabla_{b}k^{a} = 0$$

 Light propagation is received in the direction determined by unit spatial vector n^a

$$n^a n_a = 1, \quad n^a u_a = 0$$

•
$$k^a$$
 is split as: $k^a = E(u^a + n^a)$

where E = - U_ak^a: energy associated with the rays

1+1+2 Covariant Approach

Involves 1+1+2 splitting of space-time into the time direction u^a and a further slicing of space into a preferred direction e^a and sheet [Clarkson & Barrett 2003]

$$e^a e_a = 1, \quad e_a u^a = 0.$$

The projection onto the 2-D sheet,

$$N_{a}^{b} = h_{a}^{b} - e^{b}e_{a} = h_{a}^{b} + u^{b}u_{a} - e^{b}e_{a}$$

orthogonal to e^a and u^a

$$u^a N_{ab} = e^a N_{ab} = 0$$

1+1+2 Covariant Approach

- Spatial derivatives:
 - derivative in the e^a direction:

$$\hat{\psi}_{a\ldots b}^{\ c\ldots d} = e^e D_e \psi_{a\ldots b}^{\ c\ldots d}$$

projected derivative onto the sheet:

$$\delta_e \psi_{a\dots b}^{\ c\dots d} = N_e^j N_a^f \dots N_b^g N_h^c \dots N_i^d D_j \psi_{f\dots g}^{\ h\dots i}$$

Spatial derivative of e^a results in new variables:

$$D_{a}e_{b} = -e_{a}\dot{u}_{b} + \frac{1}{2}\phi N_{ab} + \xi \varepsilon_{ab} + \zeta_{ab}$$

acceleration (expansion shear vorticity of the sheet

Dynamics

Irreducible set of variables:

 $\left\{\Theta, \mathcal{A}, \Omega, \Sigma, \phi, \xi, \mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H}, \mathcal{A}^{a}, \Omega^{a}, \Sigma^{a}, \alpha^{a}, a^{a}, \mathcal{E}^{a}, \mathcal{H}^{a}, \Sigma_{ab}, \zeta_{ab}, \mathcal{E}_{ab}, \mathcal{H}_{ab}\right\}$ together with:

$$\left\{\mu^{tot}, p^{tot}, Q^{tot}, \Pi^{tot}, Q^{tot}, \Pi^{tot}_{ab}
ight\}$$

wholly characterize the space-time.

 The dynamical equations constitute those from decomposition of the 1+3 equations + dynamical equations for kinematic variables.

- Locally rotationally symmetric space-times (LRS), exhibit locally a unique preferred spatial direction constituting a local axis of symmetry
- The kinematical & thermodynamic variables $\left\{\mathcal{A}, \Theta, \phi, \Sigma, \Omega, \mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H}, \mu^{tot}, p^{tot}, Q^{tot}, \Pi^{tot}\right\}$ fully describe LRS space-times
- The space-times are isotropic and therefore all the vector and tensor 1+1+2 variables are zero.

LRS class II:

- admit spherically symmetric solutions
- vanishing vorticity Ω , ξ and consequently magnetic Weyl curvature *H*, vanishes $\left\{\mathcal{A}, \theta, \phi, \Sigma, \mathcal{E}, \mu^{tot}, p^{tot}, Q^{tot}, \Pi^{tot}\right\}$

Propagation equations

$$\begin{split} \hat{\phi} &= - \quad \frac{1}{2}\phi^2 + \left(\frac{1}{3}\Theta + \Sigma\right)\left(\frac{2}{3}\Theta - \Sigma\right) - \frac{2}{3}\mu - \frac{1}{2}\Pi - \mathcal{E}\\ \hat{\Sigma} - \frac{2}{3}\hat{\Theta} &= - \quad \frac{3}{2}\phi\Sigma - Q \ ,\\ \hat{\mathcal{E}} - \frac{1}{3}\hat{\mu} + \frac{1}{2}\hat{\Pi} &= - \quad \frac{3}{2}\phi\left(\mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{2}\Pi\right) + \left(\frac{1}{2}\Sigma - \frac{1}{3}\Theta\right)Q \ . \end{split}$$



.

LRS (Evolution equations

LRS

 $\dot{\phi} = -\left(\Sigma - \frac{2}{3}\Theta\right)\left(\mathcal{A} - \frac{1}{2}\phi\right) + Q,$ $\dot{\nabla} - \frac{2}{3}\dot{\Theta} = -\mathcal{A}\phi + 2\left(\frac{1}{3}\Theta - \frac{1}{2}\Sigma\right)^{2} + \frac{1}{3}(\mu + 3p) - \mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{2}\Pi,$ $\dot{\nabla} - \frac{2}{3}\dot{\Theta} = -\mathcal{A}\phi + 2\left(\frac{1}{3}\Theta - \frac{1}{2}\Sigma\right)^{2} + \frac{1}{3}(\mu + 3p) - \mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{2}\Pi,$ $\dot{\mathcal{E}} - \frac{1}{3}\dot{\mu} + \frac{1}{2}\dot{\Pi} = \left(\frac{3}{2}\Sigma - \Theta\right)\mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{4}\left(\Sigma - \frac{2}{3}\Theta\right)\Pi$ $+ \frac{1}{2}\phi Q - \frac{1}{2}(\mu + p)\left(\Sigma - \frac{2}{3}\Theta\right).$

Propagation/Evolution Equations

$$\begin{split} \dot{\mu} + \hat{Q} &= - \quad \Theta \left(\mu + p \right) - \left(\phi + 2\mathcal{A} \right) Q - \frac{3}{2} \Sigma \Pi \ , \\ \dot{Q} + \hat{p} + \hat{\Pi} &= - \quad \left(\frac{3}{2} \phi + \mathcal{A} \right) \Pi - \left(\frac{4}{3} \Theta + \Sigma \right) Q - \left(\mu + p \right) \mathcal{A} \\ \hat{\mathcal{A}} - \dot{\Theta} &= - \quad \left(\mathcal{A} + \phi \right) \mathcal{A} + \frac{1}{3} \Theta^2 + \frac{3}{2} \Sigma^2 + \frac{1}{2} \left(\mu + 3p \right) \ , \end{split}$$

Commutation relations

$$\hat{\psi} - \dot{\hat{\psi}} = -\mathcal{A}\dot{\psi} + \left(\frac{1}{3}\Theta + \Sigma\right)\hat{\psi}.$$

LRS class II:

- admit spherically symmetric solutions

 $\left\{ \mathcal{A}, \phi, \mathcal{E}, \mu^{tot}, p^{tot}, \Pi^{tot} \right\}$ • Vacuum conditions: $\left\{ \mathcal{A}, \phi, \mathcal{E}, \mu^{R}, p^{R}, \Pi^{R} \right\}$

Propagation equations

- $\hat{\phi} = -\frac{1}{2}\phi^{2} \frac{2}{3}\mu^{R} \frac{1}{2}\Pi^{R} \varepsilon,$ $\hat{\varepsilon} \frac{1}{3}\hat{\mu}^{R} + \frac{1}{2}\hat{\Pi} = -\frac{3}{2}\phi\left(\varepsilon + \frac{1}{2}\Pi^{R}\right),$
- $0 = -\mathcal{A}\phi + \frac{1}{3}\left(\mu^{R} + 3p^{R}\right) \varepsilon + \frac{1}{2}\Pi^{R},$
- $\hat{p}^{R} + \hat{\Pi}^{R} = -\left(\frac{3}{2}\phi + \mathcal{A}\right)\Pi^{R} \left(\mu^{R} + p^{R}\right)\mathcal{A},$

 $\hat{\mathcal{A}} = -(\mathcal{A} + \phi)\mathcal{A} + \frac{1}{2}(\mu^{R} + 3p^{R})$

LRS II + Static + Vacuum

• μ^R , p^R , and Π^R are defined:

$$\begin{split} \mu^{R} &= \frac{1}{f'} \bigg[\frac{1}{2} \big(Rf' - f \big) + f' \hat{X} + f'' X \phi + f'' X^{2} \bigg], \\ p^{R} &= \frac{1}{f'} \bigg[\frac{1}{2} \big(f - Rf' \big) - \frac{2}{3} f' \hat{X} - \frac{2}{3} f'' X \phi - \frac{2}{3} f'' X^{2} - \mathcal{A} f'' X \bigg], \\ \Pi^{R} &= \frac{1}{f'} \bigg[\frac{2}{3} f'' X^{2} + \frac{2}{3} f' \hat{X} - \frac{1}{3} f'' X \phi \bigg]. \end{split}$$

• where $X = \hat{R}$

- The space-time is determined by the scalar functions *R*, *X*, *Φ*, *A*
- To find solutions to R, X, Φ, A we include the propagation equations in the direction of e^a:

$$f'\left[\hat{\phi} + \phi\left(\frac{1}{2}\phi - \mathcal{A}\right)\right] = \frac{1}{3}Rf' - \frac{2}{3}f + f''X(\phi + 2\mathcal{A}),$$

$$f'\left[\hat{\mathcal{A}} + \mathcal{A}(\mathcal{A} + \phi)\right] = \frac{1}{6}f - \frac{1}{3}Rf' - f''X\mathcal{A},$$

$$\hat{R} = X,$$

$$f'\hat{\chi} = -\frac{1}{3}Rf' + \frac{2}{3}f - f''X^2 - X(\phi + \mathcal{A})f''.$$

Trace equation

Covariant results for spherically symmetric system:

Condition for existence of solutions with vanishing Ricci scalar:

Imposing $|f'(0) < +\infty|$, $|f''(0) < +\infty|$, $|f'''(0) < +\infty|$, f(0) = 0 & R = 0

- f'(0)=0: Propagation equations are identically satisfied for all A and Φ that guarantees R=0 and hence X=0
 - For models with a vanishing Ricci scalar in GR will be a solution to the system.
 - Fourth order gravity solutions = GR solutions + additional e.g. Reissner Nordstrom

Covariant results for spherically symmetric system:

Condition for existence of solutions with constant $\Rightarrow X.\hat{X} = 0$ *curvature* : Imposing $R = R_0 = const$ $\left| f_{0}^{\prime} \right| \hat{\phi} + \phi \left(\frac{1}{2} \phi - \mathcal{A} \right) \right| = \frac{1}{3} R_{0} f_{0}^{\prime} - \frac{2}{3} f_{0},$ $f_0' \Big[\hat{\mathcal{A}} + \mathcal{A} \Big(\mathcal{A} + \phi \Big) \Big] = \frac{1}{6} f_0 - \frac{1}{3} R_0 f',$ $0 = -R_0 f'_0 + 2f_0$. \Rightarrow Barrow & Ottewill (1983) • Solution iff $\succ f'_0 \neq 0, f_0 0 \neq 0, 2f_0 - R_0 f'_0 = 0$ $\succ f'_0 \neq 0, f_0 = 0, 2f_0 - R_0 f'_0 = 0$ (Schwarzschild) $\succ f'_0 = 0, f_0 = 0, R = R_0$

Covariant results for spherically symmetric system:

- The curious case of R² gravity
 - It is expected from $2f(R_0) R_0 f'(R_0) = 0$ that the conditions for constant curvature connects
 - with universal constants
 - Local constant of integration is obtained here instead for R² Schwarzschild/Ads space-time
 - Implies two bodies behaving as different Schwarzschild/Ads objects with different constant values can't have their masses determined uniquely just by studying their geodesics

Coordinate system relation

- Define hat derivative $\hat{M} = \frac{1}{2}r\phi\frac{dM}{dr}$
- Specialize choice of equations to f(R) = Rⁿ

$$\frac{1}{2}nr\phi\frac{d\phi}{dr}R^{n-1} = \left(\mathcal{A} - \frac{1}{2}\phi\right)\phi R^{n-1} + \frac{n-2}{3n}R^n + (n-1)R^{n-1}X(\phi+2\mathcal{A}),$$

$$\frac{1}{2}nr\phi\frac{d\mathcal{A}}{dr}R^{n-1} = -(\mathcal{A} + \phi)\mathcal{A}R^{n-1} + \frac{1-2n}{6n}R^n - (n-1)R^{n-2}X\mathcal{A},$$

$$\frac{1}{2}r\phi\frac{d\mathcal{R}}{dr} = X,$$

$$\frac{1}{2}nr\phi(n-1)\frac{dX}{dr}R^{n-2} = \frac{2-n}{3}R^n - n(n-1)(n-2)R^{n-3}X^2.$$

Exact *Rⁿ* solutions:

Schwarzschild solution:

- R=0, dR/dr=0, gives usual Schwarzschild coordinates iff n=1,2,>3
- Solution with constant non-zero R:
 Substitute X=0, R=R₀≠0 gives a solution iff n=2

- Solution with non-constant Ricci scalar nonvanishing at infinity:
 - From the ansatz: $\phi = \sqrt{C_1 r^{\alpha} + C_2 r^{\beta}}$, $R = C_3 / r^{\gamma} (\gamma > 0)$
 - We get (provided $n < (1 + \sqrt{3})/2$ and for $n \in (1, (1 + \sqrt{3}/2))$

n is an even rational number)

$$\mathcal{A} = \frac{-C(5-4n)r^{-1-\frac{5-4n}{2-n}} + (2n-2)(2n-1)r^{-1+\frac{(2n-2)(2n-1)}{2-n}}}{2(2-n)\left(Cr^{-\frac{5-4n}{2-n}} + r^{\frac{(2n-2)(2n-1)}{2-n}}\right)\sqrt{\frac{(1+2n-2n^2)(7-10n+4n^2)}{(2-n)^2\left(1+Cr^{-\frac{7-10n+4n^2}{2-n}}\right)}} \quad ; \quad \phi = \frac{2}{r\sqrt{\frac{(1+2n-2n^2)(7-10n+4n^2)}{(2-n)^2\left(1+Cr^{-\frac{7-10n+4n^2}{2-n}}\right)}}}$$

$$R = \frac{6n(n-1)}{[2n(n-1)-1]r^2} \quad ; \quad X = -\frac{12n(n-1)}{[2n(n-1)-1]r^3} \sqrt{\frac{(1+2n-2n^2)(7-10n+4n^2)}{(2-n)^2\left(1+Cr^{-\frac{7-10n+4n^2}{2-n}}\right)}}$$

• Solving for the metric definitions of the covariant scalars: $\mathcal{A} = \frac{1}{2A(r)} \frac{dA}{dr} \sqrt{B(r)}, \quad \phi = \frac{2}{r} \sqrt{B(r)}$

A(r) and *B(r)* are from the metric:

$$ds^{2} = -A(r)dt^{2} + B(r)dr^{2} + r^{2}(d\vartheta^{2} + \sin^{2}\vartheta d\phi^{2})$$

Gives the solution (also found by T. Clifton 2006):

$$A(r) = r^{(2n-2)\frac{(2n-1)}{(2-n)}} + \frac{C}{\frac{(5-4n)}{r^{(2-n)}}}; \quad \frac{1}{B(r)} = \frac{(2-n)^2}{(7-10n+4n^2)(1+2n-2n^2)} \left(1 + \frac{C}{\frac{(7-10n+4n^2)}{r^{(2-n)}}}\right)$$

Consider now the geometry of a null congruence using the 1+1+2 formalism.
 The kinematics are based on a null vector *k^a* which can be split as

$$k^a = E(u^a + \kappa e^a + \kappa^a)$$

- where E (energy of ray) and κ (magnitude of radial component) are the lensing variables
- The derivative in the k^a direction is defined $f' = k^a \nabla_a f$ with $f' = E \kappa \hat{f}$





Fig2: geometry of the deflection angle

The general form of the deflection angle is given

$$\alpha = \int_{\nu_1}^{\nu_2} \frac{1}{r} |E| \sqrt{1 - \kappa^2} d\nu - \alpha_0$$

for any form of gravity

From:

• the propagation equations of *E* and κ (in static LRS II conditions): $E' = -E^2 \mathcal{A}\kappa$,

$$\kappa' = E\left(1 - \kappa^2\right)\left(\frac{1}{2}\phi - \mathcal{A}\right)$$

• the solution to $\mathcal A$ and $\mathcal \Phi$

Deflection Angle in f(R)

• The **deflection angle** :

$$\alpha = 2 \int_{r_0}^{r_*} L^{-1} \frac{J}{r^2} \left[r^{\frac{(4n^2 - 6n + 2)}{(n-2)}} - J^2 \left(r^{-2} + Cr^{\frac{(4n^2 - 12n + 11)}{(n-2)}} \right) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} dr - \pi$$

where:

$$J = \left[\frac{\frac{3(2n-3)}{r_0^{n-2}}}{\frac{\frac{-4n^2+10n-7}{n-2}}{r_0^{n-2}} + C}\right]^{\frac{1}{2}}; \quad L = \sqrt{\frac{(n-2)^2}{(1+2n-2n^2)(7-10n+4n^2)}}$$

Observables



Fig3: plot of comparative bending angle vs n for various distances from source

Observables



Fig4: plot of comparative bending angle vs n for various distances of closest approach

Conclusion

The deflection angle from the metric approach:

$$\alpha = \int_{r_0}^{r_*} \frac{(AB)^{1/2} dr}{r \sqrt{(r/r_0)^2 B(r_0) - B(r)}} - \pi$$

- Advantage of the covariant approach:
 - Applies to any LRS space-time whilst metric applies only to spherically symmetric space-times
 - Physically relevant quantities (the kinematic & dynamic variables & their propagation equations) manifesting the underlying physics for better understanding

Conclusion

- A set of master equations that provide important results and conditions for spherically symmetric static solutions in *f(R)* gravity were derived [gr-qc/ 0908.3333]
- A number of exact solutions were found from these equations for *f(R)* = *Rⁿ* → indicative of Birkoff's theorem violation
- A covariant form of the bending angle for a particular solution was derived where more bending expected for *Rⁿ* gravity model and could be used to obtain signatures for these models