# Hot Attractors



Kevin Goldstein MITP, University of the Witwatersrand Kruger 2015 Thanks to Vishnu Jejjala for many slides



## Collaborators





Vishnu Jejjala (Wits)

#### Suresh Nampuri (Lisbon)

Arxiv:1410.3478 & work in progress

#### Outline

- Black hole thermodynamics
- The attractor mechanism (T=0)
- Hot attractors (*T*≠0)
- CFT take on bulk gravity results
- Summary & Prospects

## **Blackhole thermodynamics**

- O<sup>th</sup> Law
  - T is constant throughout body in thermal equilibrium
  - Event horizon surface gravity constant

1<sup>st</sup> Law

- $dE = TdS pdV + \mu dN$
- $= dM = T_{H}dS_{BH} + \Omega dJ + \Phi dQ$

 $T_H = \frac{\kappa}{2\pi}$  $S_{BH} = \frac{A}{4G_N}$ 

2<sup>nd</sup> Law

- $\Delta S \ge 0$
- $\Delta S_{BH} + \Delta S_{\text{Universe}} \ge 0$

## **Gravitational Thermodynamics**



- Horizons and singularities are *effective* notions in gravity that arise only as a consequence of a thermodynamic averaging over microstates, or *coarse-graining*
- Origin of entropy lies in the inability of a semi-classical observer to distinguish different quantum microstates

## Inner horizon "thermodynamics"

- BHs can have two horizons (at r<sub>±</sub> say)
  - r\_: inner (Cauchy)
  - r<sub>+</sub>: outer (Event)
- eg. Reissner-Nördstrom, Kerr
- $S_{BH}$  associated with outer horizon

#### Inner horizon "thermodynamics"

• 1<sup>st</sup> Law  

$$dM = T_+ dS + \Omega_+ dJ + \Phi_+ dQ \quad \text{(Outer)}$$

$$-dM = T_- dS - \Omega_- dJ - \Phi_- dQ \quad \text{(Inner)}$$

Curir, 1979

## Inner horizon "thermodynamics"

• 1<sup>st</sup> Law  

$$dM = T_+ dS + \Omega_+ dJ + \Phi_+ dQ \quad \text{(Outer)}$$

$$dM = T_- dS + \Omega_- dJ + \Phi_- dQ \quad \text{(Inner)}$$

- to preserve form we take T\_ negative
- 2<sup>nd</sup> Law

#### ?? what can entropy of inner horizon mean ??

recent work by Martinec for µ-states

Curir. 1979

GJN – to appear

#### **Attractor mechanism**

Ferrara, Kallosh, Strominger, 1995

- Feature of  $T_{\mu}=0$  black holes
- Scalars (moduli) drawn to fixed values at horizon
  - $\varphi_H$  depend on charges carried by BH
  - independent of starting point ( $\varphi_{_{\infty}}$ )



#### Attractor mechanism

• Feature of  $T_{\mu}=0$  black holes

Ferrara, Kallosh, Strominger, 1995

- Scalars (moduli) drawn to fixed values at horizon
  - $\varphi_{H}$  depend on charges carried by BH
  - independent of starting point ( $\varphi_{\infty}$ ) ie. Vevs @  $\infty$
- Entropy independent of  $\varphi_{\infty}$
- Not require SUSY

Ferrara, Gibbons, Kallosh 1997 (implicit) Sen 2005 Goldstein, lizuka, Jena, Trivedi, 2005

## Hand waving explanation

- Number of microstates is determined by quantized charges
- Entropy, which counts number of microstates, cannot vary continuously
- Moduli vary continuously

 $\rightarrow$  entropy (horizon area) must be independent of background moduli

 $\rightarrow$  Moduli assume fixed values at horizon determined by charges

## $T_{\mu}=0$ details

$$\begin{split} S &= \frac{1}{\kappa^2} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \, \left( R - 2(\nabla \phi_i)^2 - f_{ab}(\phi_i) F^a_{\mu\nu} F^{b,\mu\nu} \right) & \text{Action} \\ R_{\mu\nu} &- 2 \partial_\mu \phi_i \partial_\nu \phi_i = 2 f_{ab}(\phi_i) \left( 2 F^a_{\mu\lambda} F^{b,\lambda} - \frac{1}{2} g_{\mu\nu} F^a_{\lambda\sigma} F^{b,\lambda\sigma} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{-g}} \partial_\mu (\sqrt{-g} \, \partial^\mu \phi_i) = \frac{1}{4} (\partial_i f_{ab}) F^a_{\mu\nu} F^{b,\mu\nu} & \text{EOM} \\ &= \partial_\mu (\sqrt{-g} \, f_{ab}(\phi_i) F^{b,\mu\nu}) = 0 \\ ds^2 &= -a(r)^2 dt^2 + a(r)^{-2} dr^2 + b(r)^2 d\Omega_2^2 \\ & F^a &= Q^a_m \sin \theta \, d\theta \wedge d\phi \\ &= \phi(r) \\ V_{\text{eff}} &= f_{ab}(\phi_i) Q^a_m Q^b_m & \text{Effective potential} \end{split}$$

Goldstein, lizuka, Jena, Trivedi, 2005

#### **EOM for** $ds^2 = -a(r)^2 dt^2 + a(r)^{-2} dr^2 + b(r)^2 d\Omega^2$

One equation is easy to integrate

$$(a^2 b^2)'' = 2 \implies a^2 b^2 = (r - r_+)(r - r_-)$$

• 
$$r_{+} \rightarrow r_{-}$$
 gives  $T_{H} = 0$ .

Others not so easy

$$-\frac{b''}{b} = (\phi')^2 \qquad \left(a^2 b^2 \phi'_i\right)' = \frac{\partial_i V_{\text{eff}}(\phi)}{2b^2} \qquad \partial_i = \frac{\partial}{\partial \phi_i}$$

$$-1 + a^2 b'^2 + \frac{a^{2\prime} b^{2\prime}}{2} = -\frac{V_{\text{eff}}(\phi_i)}{b^2} + a^2 b^2 (\phi')^2$$

## EOM @ Horizon, T=0

One equation is easy to integrate

$$(a^2 b^2)'' = 2 \implies a^2 b^2 = (r - r_+)(r - r_-)$$

•  $r_{+} \rightarrow r_{-}$  gives  $T_{H}=0$ .

Others not so easy

$$-\frac{b''}{b} = (\phi')^2 \qquad \left(a^2 b^2 \phi'_i\right)' = \frac{\partial_i V_{\text{eff}}(\phi)}{2b^2} \qquad \partial_i = \frac{\partial}{\partial \phi_i}$$

1<sup>st</sup> order Hamiltonian constraint



### **Attractor Equations**

#### Scalar EOM on horzon:

$$\partial_i V_{eff}(\phi_0) = 0, \quad \partial_i = \frac{\partial}{\partial \phi_i}$$

if  $M_{ij} = \partial_i \partial_j V_{\text{eff}}(\phi_0)$  has non-negative eigenvalues

2

#### $\phi_0 = \{\phi_{i0}\}$ are attractor values

then from Hamiltonian constraint:

 $b_h^2 = V_{
m eff}(\phi_0)$ 

We can now read off

$$S_{
m BH} = rac{1}{4} A = \pi b_h^2 = \pi V_{
m eff}(\phi_0)$$

#### **Attractor Equations – for later**

$$\frac{\partial_i V_{eff}(\phi_0)}{b_h^2} = 0$$

$$\frac{V_{eff}(\phi_0)}{b_h^2} - 1 = 0$$

Near horizon extremal geometry:

• Generically get  $AdS_2 \times S^2$ 

#### Area Law

- A<sub>±</sub> := area of outer/inner horizon
- A<sub>+</sub>A\_\_\_\_\_\_
  Larsen, 1997
  - function only of quantized charges
  - independent of mass
- taking extremal limit → geometric mean law:

$$A_+A_- = A_{\text{ext}}^2$$

 Observed d=4 Kerr & Kerr-Newmann, d=5 Myers-Perry etc.

Cvetic, Gibbons, Pope, 2010

#### Hot attractors

$$A_+A_- = A_{\text{ext}}^2 \Rightarrow S_+S_- = S_{\text{ext}}^2$$

- $S_{ext}$  is function of conserved charges (J,Q)  $\rightarrow$  independent of mass, asymptotic moduli
- Generalises to Wald entropy
  - Caveat: not work when Smarr relation violated

Castro, Dehmami, Giribet, Kastor, 2013

S<sub>1</sub> depends on mass & moduli

 $\rightarrow$  There is some hot attractor mechanism/conspiracy involving both horizons so that S<sub>1</sub>S<sub>1</sub> indep of mass, asymptotic moduli.

#### BTZ: Area law = level matching

Black hole in AdS<sub>3</sub> – 2 Virasoros
 use holographic dictionary to interpret A<sub>+</sub>A<sub>-</sub>

• 1<sup>st</sup> Law 
$$dM = T_{\pm}dS + \Omega_{\pm}dJ$$

• Gravity  

$$\begin{array}{l} S_{\pm} = \frac{A_{\pm}}{4G_3} = \frac{\pi r_{\pm}}{2G_3} \\ J = \frac{r_{+}r_{-}}{4G_3L} \\ J = \frac{r_{+}r_{-}}{4G_3L} \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2\pi r_{\pm}L^2} \\ \Gamma_{\pm} = \frac{r_{\pm}}{r_{\pm}L} \\ \Gamma_{\pm} = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2\pi L^2} \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2\pi L^2} \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2\pi L^2} \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_L} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_R} \right) \\ I = \frac{r_{\pm}}{2} \left( \frac{1}{T_R} \pm \frac{1}{T_R} \right) \\ I = \frac{r$$

 $T_{H} \neq 0$  details

#### Same EOM

$$S = \frac{1}{\kappa^2} \int d^4x \,\sqrt{-g} \,\left(R - 2(\nabla\phi_i)^2 - f_{ab}(\phi_i)F^a_{\mu\nu}F^{b,\mu\nu}\right) \quad \text{Action}$$

$$R_{\mu\nu} - 2\partial_\mu\phi_i\partial_\nu\phi_i = 2f_{ab}(\phi_i) \left(2F^a_{\mu\lambda}F^{b,\lambda}_{\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}F^a_{\lambda\sigma}F^{b,\lambda\sigma}\right)$$

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{-g}}\partial_\mu(\sqrt{-g} \,\partial^\mu\phi_i) = \frac{1}{4}(\partial_i f_{ab})F^a_{\mu\nu}F^{b,\mu\nu} \quad \text{EOM}$$

$$\partial_\mu(\sqrt{-g} \,f_{ab}(\phi_i)F^{b,\mu\nu}) = 0$$

$$ds^{2} = -a(r)^{2}dt^{2} + a(r)^{-2}dr^{2} + b(r)^{2}d\Omega_{2}^{2}$$
$$F^{a} = Q_{m}^{a}\sin\theta \ d\theta \wedge d\phi$$
$$\phi = \phi(r)$$

$$V_{\rm eff} = f_{ab}(\phi_i) Q^a_m Q^b_m$$

**Effective potential** 

Ansatz



#### Same EOM

- Scalars take on values at horizon that depend on values at infinitiy (not attractive)
- There are robust invariant quantities that we derive

 $T_{\mu} \neq 0$  details

- As before:  $a^2 b^2 = (r r_+)(r r_-)$
- Horizons : a=0
- Periodicity in Euclidean time:

$$T_{\pm} = \frac{(a^2)'_{\pm}}{2\pi} = \pm \frac{r_+ - r}{4\pi b_{\pm}^2}$$

$$b_{+}^{2}T_{+} = -b_{-}^{2}T_{-}$$

Notation: non-extremality parameter

$$\Delta = \frac{r_+ - r_-}{2}$$

#### **Deriving Geomtric Mean Law**

• From 
$$b_+^2 T_+ = -b_-^2 T_-$$
 and  $b^2 \sim S$ :  
 $\rightarrow S_+ T_+ + S_- T_- = 0$ 

• 1<sup>st</sup> Law: 
$$dM = T_{\pm} dS_{\pm} \Rightarrow T_{\pm}^{-1} = \left. \frac{\partial S_{\pm}}{\partial M} \right|_{J,Q}$$

• So: 
$$\left. \frac{\partial}{\partial M} (S_+ S_-) \right|_{J,Q} = \frac{S_+ T_+ + S_- T_-}{T_+ T_-} = 0$$

- Taking  $\Delta \rightarrow 0$  limit:  $S_+S_- = S_{ext}^2$
- (have more general proof)

## Hot black holes are unattractive



Goldstein, lizuka, Jena, Trivedi, 2005



0.05

 $M, Q_i$  constant  $r = (r_+ - r_-)\rho + r_-$ 

$$\phi_0=rac{1}{2}(\phi_++\phi_-)$$

Flows intersect attractor value





5.5

5.0

4.5

 $M, Q_i$  constant  $r = (r_{+} - r_{-})\rho + r_{-}$ 



#### Attractor Equations, T=0

$$\frac{\partial_i V_{eff}(\phi_0)}{b_h^2} = 0$$

$$\frac{V_{eff}(\phi_0)}{b_h^2} - 1 = 0$$

 $T_{\mu} \neq 0$  details

$$egin{aligned} -1 + a^2 \, b'^2 + rac{a^{2\prime} \, b^{2\prime}}{2} &= -rac{V_{ ext{eff}}(\phi_i)}{b^2} + a^2 \, b^2 \, (\phi')^2 \ &igg(a^2 \, b^2 \, \phi'_iigg)' = rac{\partial_i V_{ ext{eff}}(\phi)}{2b^2} \ &igg(arrow r_+) &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

BC:

$$a(r_{\pm}) = 0$$
  
 $(a^2)'(r_{\pm}) b^2(r_{\pm}) = \pm \Delta$ 

 Find averaged attractor eqns

$$\int_{r_{-}}^{r_{+}} dr \left(\frac{\partial_{i} V_{eff}}{b^{2}}\right) = 0$$
$$\int_{r_{-}}^{r_{+}} dr \left(\frac{V_{eff}}{b^{2}} - 1\right) = 0$$

### Marketing

 First order fluctuations of moduli between horizons satisfy

$$\partial_z (z^2 - 1) \partial_z \delta \phi = \lambda^2 \delta \phi$$

where 
$$\lambda^2 = \left. \frac{\partial_{\phi}^2 V}{2b_h^2} \right|_{\phi = \phi_h} = \frac{m^2}{b_h^2}$$

- equations of scalar in AdS<sub>2</sub>
  - is this coincidence or sign of something deeper ?
    To appear

## Comparing $T_{\mu}=0$ and $T_{\mu}\neq 0$

#### **Extremal**

#### Moduli independent area

#### Non-extremal

Moduli independent product of areas

$$\left\langle \frac{V_{\text{eff}}(\phi)}{b^2} - 1 \right\rangle_{\text{AdS}_2 \times S^2} = 0$$

$$\left\langle \frac{\partial_{\phi_i} V_{\text{eff}}(\phi)}{b^2} \right\rangle_{\text{AdS}_2 \times S^2} = 0$$

$$\left\langle rac{V_{ ext{eff}}(\phi)}{b^2} - 1 
ight
angle_{ ext{Region 2}} = 0$$

$$\left\langle rac{\partial_{\phi_i} V_{\mathrm{eff}}(\phi)}{b^2} 
ight
angle_{\mathrm{Region}\ 2} = 0$$

### **Harrison Transformation**

- AdS<sub>2</sub> black hole lifts to BTZ in AdS<sub>3</sub>
- Can interpret entropy in AdS<sub>3</sub> via Cardy
- Computation of entropy moduli indep.
- Harrison transformation maps asymptotically flat black holes to asymptotically AdS keeping same near horizon
- Can use here?
  - can map constant scalar solution to asymptotically AdS<sub>2</sub>×S<sup>2</sup>
  - given geometric mean law, sufficient to consider constant scalar case

#### **Harrison Transformation**

• Recall BTZ: T=0 
$$\rightarrow T_R = \frac{r_h}{\pi L^2} T_L = 0$$

• Take 
$$a \to \Lambda(r) a$$
,  $b \to \frac{b}{\Lambda(r)}$ ,  $\Lambda(r) = \frac{r_+ r_-}{r}$   
– (symmetry of EOM)

 $\rightarrow$  BH in AdS<sub>2</sub>×S<sup>2</sup> (scalars const) :

$$ds^{2} = -\frac{(r-r_{-})(r-r_{+})}{\ell^{2}}dt^{2} + \frac{\ell^{2}}{(r-r_{+})(r-r_{-})}dr^{2} + \ell^{2}d\Omega_{2}^{2}, \qquad l^{2} = V_{\text{eff}}(\phi_{0})$$

• Lift to BH in  $AdS_3 \times S^2$ 

$$ds^{2} = -\frac{(r-r_{-})(r-r_{+})}{\ell^{2}}dt^{2} + \frac{\ell^{2}}{(r-r_{+})(r-r_{-})}dr^{2} + r^{2}(dy + \frac{r_{+}r_{-}}{\ell r}dt)^{2} + \ell^{2}d\Omega_{2}^{2}.$$

#### **Brown & Henneaux**

- Consider AdS<sub>3</sub>
- With suitable B.C., Large diffeos generate Vir×Vir  $[L_m, L_n] = (m - n)L_{m+n} + \frac{c_L}{12}(m^3 - m)\delta_{m+n,0}$

- Central charge is  $c_L = c_R = \frac{3}{2G_3\sqrt{-\Lambda}} = \frac{3\ell}{2G_3}$
- Precursor to AdS<sub>3</sub>/CFT<sub>2</sub>

### **CTF & Area Law**

• Use holographic dictionary (units:  $8G_3 = 1$ )

$$M = \frac{r_+^2 + r_-^2}{\ell^2} \implies M\ell = L_0 + \overline{L}_0$$
$$J = \frac{2r_+r_-}{\ell} \implies J = L_0 - \overline{L}_0$$

- Partition function Z(τ) of CFT is same as partition function of gravity theory on (a quotient of) AdS<sub>3</sub> whose boundary geometry is same as that of torus
- This modular parameter is given by Euclidean BTZ geometry  $Z(q,\overline{q}) = \operatorname{Tr} q^{L_0} \overline{q}^{\overline{L}_0}$

$$\tau = y + it_E \;,\; q = e^{2\pi i\tau}$$

## **CTF & Area Law**

- $L_0 + \overline{L}_0$  generates time translation
  - periodicity of t<sub>E</sub> gives T

$$egin{aligned} &Z(q,\overline{q}) = \operatorname{Tr} q^{L_0} \overline{q}^{\overline{L}_0} \ & au = y + it_E \ , \ q = e^{2\pi i au} \end{aligned}$$

- $L_0 \overline{L}_0$  generates space translation
  - use SL(2,Z) to shift Re τ
    - → symmetry if  $L_0 \overline{L}_0$  quantized
- black holes of different mass at fixed quantum numbers have different temperatures
  - $L_0 + \overline{L}_0$  changes
  - $L_0 \overline{L}_0$  stays same as vary mass (ortho. circle) •  $L_{0-}\overline{L}_0 \sim r_+r_- = r_{ext}^2 \sim A_{ext}$

#### Hot attractive branes

- Look at black brane Gauged SUGRA solutions in 5D
- Harrison Txn  $\rightarrow$  Asymptotically Lifschitz spaces (not AdS<sub>2</sub>)
  - Work in progress

### Summary

- We have adapted the attractor mechanism for nonsupersymmetric, non-extremal black holes to derive for a class of black holes: A<sub>1</sub>A<sub>2</sub> = A<sup>2</sup><sub>ext</sub>
  - $T=0 \rightarrow \text{average over AdS}_2 \times S^2$
  - $T \neq 0 \rightarrow$  average over region between horizons
- CFT interpretation stems from constancy of L<sub>0</sub>-L<sub>0</sub> as mass varies

#### Prospectus

- Study the geometry of solutions space can we extract invariants?
- Can we describe non-extremal black holes in a first order formalism?
- How seriously should we take inner horizon thermodynamics?
  - Is there an underlying theory of statistical mechanics for inner horizon?
  - What degrees of freedom (if any) does the area of the inner horizon count?
- Harrison→ non-Extremal BH in of AdS<sub>2</sub>X S<sup>2</sup>
  - Entanglement entropy?